

## PROJECT BRIEF

### 1. Identifiers

<b>Project Number:</b>	RAS/97/A05
<b>Project Title:</b>	Preparation of a Strategic Action Programme (SAP) and Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) for the Tumen River Area, its coastal regions and related Northeast Asian Environs.
<b>Project Duration:</b>	Two (2) Years.
<b>GEF Implementing Agency:</b>	UNDP
<b>Executing Agency:</b>	UNOPS
<b>Requesting Countries:</b>	Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Mongolia, People's Republic of China, Republic of Korea and the Russian Federation.
<b>GEF Eligibility:</b>	Eligible to receive UNDP technical assistance and participation in the restructured GEF: DPRK - 6 May 1994; Mongolia - 14 April 1994; PRC - 16 May 1994; ROK - 3 May 1994; Russian Federation - 23 June 1994
<b>GEF Focal Area:</b>	International Waters, secondarily biodiversity
<b>GEF Programming Framework:</b>	OP. 9: Integrated land and waters multiple focal area  Secondarily, OP. 2: Coastal, freshwater and marine ecosystems

---

**2. Summary:** The purpose of this project is to prepare a Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) and a Strategic Action Programme (SAP) for the Tumen River Economic Development Area. The implementation of the SAP will assist in the implementation of the Memorandum of Understanding among the Tumen River Area Development Programme member states by integrating and applying sound land and water resource management strategies. The implementation of the SAP will also entail a number of interventions focused on the conservation of biodiversity designed to obtain national, regional and global benefits, with GEF financing their incremental cost. The SAP will provide a common framework for the identification and formulation of strategies, programmes and projects, responding primarily to transboundary issues of environmental management.

---

### 3. Cost and Financing:

<b>GEF:</b>	<b>Project</b>	:	US\$ 4,957,200
	<b>PDF</b>	:	US\$ 242,271
	<b>Sub-total</b>	:	US\$ 5,199,471

---

Co-Financing:	UNDP/ROK :	US\$ 250,000 (cash)
	UNDP/TRADP	US\$ 3,216,000
	Government :	US\$ 2,000,800 (in-kind)
Total project cost:		US\$ 10,666,271

---

4. **Associated Financing:**

5. **GEF Operational Focal Point Endorsements:**

Mr. Li Hung Sik, General Secretary, National Coordination Committee for Environment (DPRK), letter dated 12 November 1997.

Mr. B. Ganbaatar, Director, International Cooperation Department, Ministry of Nature and Environment (Mongolia), letter dated 8 November 1997.

Mr. Chen Huan, Deputy Division Chief, World Bank Department, Ministry of Finance (PRC), letter dated 10 November 1997.

Mr. Seok-Young Choi, Director, Environment Cooperation Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (ROK), letter dated 15 November 1997.

Mr. Yuri Platonov, Deputy Head, Department of International Cooperation, State Committee on Environment Protection (Russian Federation), letter dated 15 December 1997.

6. **Implementing Agency Contact:**

Kevin Hill, Technical Advisor, RBAP/GEF UNDP

Tel: 1-212-906-5805; Fax: 1-212-906-5825

## I Background and Context

### Introduction

1. The Tumen River Economic Development Area (TREDA) and its Northeast Asian environs (hereinafter referred to as “the Region” includes parts of the People’s Republic of China, Russian Federation, Mongolia, Democratic People’s Republic of Korea (DPRK), and Republic of Korea (ROK)) are experiencing a rapid economic growth. The Tumen River area is abundant with natural resources and has a great human resource potential. As a result, there is a long-term potential to attract billions of dollars in investments for infrastructure, natural resource development, industry, mining, oil exploration and urban development. Together with the political will of all parties concerned, and the fact that it lies close to some of the world’s fastest growing and biggest economies, this area is very likely to become one of the largest international development centers in the region. The ensuing economic growth will help to alleviate poverty and bring alternatives to on-going, but often unsustainable economic activities. However, industrial and economic growth will also bring new dangers, and unless mitigation strategies are immediately implemented, growth in the Region will threaten the area’s global environmental resources.

2. The Tumen River Basin is therefore a strategic and globally significant international waters system. The international waters component is the Tumen River and all of its tributaries, Peter the Great Bay and rivers to the north and south of the Tumen River (Please see Map 1). The right bank of the Tumen River belongs to DPRK while most of the left bank belongs to China with the exception that the lower part of the left bank, which belongs to the Russian Federation. Coastal areas to the south of the river belong to DPRK and coastal areas to the north of the river belong to Russia. The coastal areas include major wetlands and many bays and inlets. Coastal currents, the north-flowing Korean Current mass and the south-flowing Primorye Current mass, interact to produce summertime cyclonic turnovers in the vicinity of Posyet Bay and the Tumen River, and other conditions which favour high productivity and biodiversity.

3. The Region is also characterized by unique biological diversity that lies at the boundary of the Boreal and Asian biomes, with the Mongolian eco-sphere lying slightly to the west of the Tumen River Basin. The Region encompasses many ecosystems of global significance for their biodiversity including coastal wetlands, marine ecosystems, temperate forests and steppe. Rare and endemic species that depend upon the area for survival include the Siberian Tiger, the Amur Leopard, the Mongolian Gazelle and several species of crane.

4. Industrial and urban development in the Region is already depleting natural resources in the catchment area of the Tumen River, in Peter the Great Bay and its coastal and marine ecosystems. For example, a number of existing industrial facilities and urban centers are discharging large quantities of untreated wastes into the Tumen River. The industrial and military history of the region provides a basis for expecting that hazardous materials and other contaminants may exist in association with closed or abandoned facilities and sites. The extensive loss of wetlands through conversion to agricultural land and alteration in the hydrological regime by human activities

continues, especially in China and the DPRK, despite the recognition of their inherent value to man and wildlife.

5. In addition to these impacts to the riparian states of the Tumen River, development in the Tumen River Basin is already beginning to have a significant impact on the environment over a wider geographical range, extending to Mongolia and the Republic of Korea. These include:

- Areas which supply the Tumen River Basin with natural resources, such as timber, fossil fuels, etc, are being depleted and degraded.
- New transport and communication routes are being built to supply natural resources to the Tumen River Basin and to deliver the Tumen River Basin products to distant markets. This construction may damage the environment and the use of the new routes may cause pollution. These routes also open up new economic frontiers for exploitation in areas which are poorly managed and regulated. Importantly, they will disrupt the migration patterns of the many migratory animals<sup>1</sup> and rare bird species which spend part of the year in or near the Tumen River Basin.
- Population growth and rising incomes in the Tumen River Basin and connected areas are creating an increasing demand for food and water. Results include a lowering of groundwater supplies and a conversion of fragile wetlands, steppe and forests into agricultural land.

6. The impacts are expected to increase dramatically in line with the predicted economic development of the Region. These threats are superimposed upon long-standing threats to natural resources in the Region, including fragmentation of habitats, fires, over-grazing, and illegal collecting and hunting.

### **Past Efforts and Baseline**

7. Recognizing the threats to their natural resource base, the five participating countries have independently taken steps to ensure a sustainable development of the Region. They have elaborated plans and identified strategies and actions for environmental protection and management of resources at national level. These include the following: Priority Programme for China's Agenda 21 (China); Biodiversity Conservation Action Plan (China); Action Programme for the 21st century (Mongolia); Biodiversity Conservation Action Plan (Mongolia); National Strategy for the Conservation of Biological Diversity (ROK); National Action Plan for Agenda 21 (ROK). In addition, Russia and DPRK have elaborated strategies and action plans for environmental protection and established national standards to control pollution. These plans include activities in the Tumen River Basin.

8. Each of the participating countries has also established protected area systems covering both biodiversity conservation and forest protection schemes for watershed management. There are 41 main biodiversity reserves in the Region. In the main, protected areas have been established in forest areas to protect single species. Most

---

<sup>1</sup> The migratory Mongolian Gazelle that ranges from Russia, through Mongolia and into China will be particularly affected.

reserves, except those in the ROK, are currently experiencing insufficient funding and management leading to problems with poaching and encroachment. A recently approved GEF project will ensure the conservation of biological diversity and provide alternative sustainable livelihood options for seven protected areas and their buffer zones in the Eastern Steppe of Mongolia.

9. In addition to these national level interventions, UNDP is working with the five governments to support regional sustainable development in the Region through the Tumen River Area Development Programme (TRADP). The TRADP is the only existing consultative forum among the five countries and as such it receives strong support by the member states. It has greatly enhanced economic collaboration in the Northeast region. A series of environmental surveys and consultations conducted under the auspices of the TRADP culminated in the signature of the *Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Principles* (MOU) by the five member states in December 1995. This historic agreement emphasizes the need for cooperation in order to safeguard local, national and regional environmental resources.

10. Most of the on-going efforts remain, however, oriented toward achieving environmental benefits at the national level. Given the transboundary nature of most of the threats to international waters and biodiversity in the Region, it is unlikely that these national and discrete efforts will be sufficient to ensure global environmental benefits. There is a need for additional, collaborative activities to protect the Region from the impacts of industrial development in the Tumen River Basin. However, the following barriers will have to be removed before these essential collaborative efforts can be implemented:

11. Lack of a consensus on priorities, targets, programmes and projects, to protect globally important environmental resources in the Region. Whereas the MOU lays the political foundations for the protection of globally important environmental resources, a comprehensive action plan remains to be developed by the five concerned parties.

12. Limited understanding of the environment - economy link in the Region. Any action plan must be based on a full, scientific assessment of the present and future impact of economic growth on international waters and biodiversity in the region. At present there is a limited understanding of the detailed interactions between the economic activities within the Region and globally significant environmental benefits, and of alternatives which would both facilitate sustainable and environmentally sound economic development.

13. Weak cooperative mechanisms. Existing cooperative mechanisms at the inter-governmental, national and local levels are weak. This has proven a major constraint to harmonizing environmental standards across the five countries of the region. As part of the implementation of the Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Principles (MOU) an Environmental Working Group has been established under the Consultative Commission of the TRADP.

14. Weak project management skills, to identify, prioritize, design, and implement key activities to protect the environment. Expertise in the five countries is limited at local

and national levels, and most available expertise focuses on economic and locally urgent environmental problems.

15. Inaccessibility and lack of scientific data. While much data already exists in the five countries, unfortunately it can often only be accessed by one country or is not considered valid by other countries. In addition, the formats of the data from the various countries are often mutually incompatible. Planning and decision-making is made difficult due to this lack of reliable, comprehensive information. On-going projects to gather data are often duplicative and otherwise inefficient.

16. Lack of community and general population involvement in the planning process. Environmental decision-making and planning is traditionally a top-down process. This greatly affects the accuracy of the data used for the planning exercise and often results in weak cooperation in the implementation of plans. Community participation is constrained by a limited awareness of environmental issues.

17. Lack of finance for global environment initiatives. All countries and local authorities in the region are under financial constraints, with priority given to investments that are economically productive in the short-term or to local environmental initiatives.

18. A detailed analysis of the root causes of environmental degradation in the region is given in Annex 5.

## **II Rationale and Objectives**

19. The long-term objective of the project is to provide global environmental benefits through the protection of the Tumen River Economic Development Area and the Northeast Asian environs, which integrate the use of sound land and water resource management strategies. In order to achieve this objective, biodiversity conservation beyond the Tumen River Basin must also be addressed. This project will therefore prepare a Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) and a Strategic Action Programme (SAP).

20. The preparation of the TDA will be based on the preliminary TDA undertaken during the preparatory phase of this project. The TDA will be used as a basis for focussing on the threats, their root causes and the sectoral activities that endanger the critical biodiversity in the Region and provide the basis for the development of GEF biodiversity projects to implement selected components of the SAP, as appropriate. In keeping with the GEF Operational Strategy, the TDA and implementation of the SAP will facilitate the five participating countries to address current and anticipated imminent threats associated to development of the Region to prevent damage to the pristine and unique areas in the Region. In particular, this project will address endangered species which cross the borders of the participating countries and are associated with development within the Tumen River Basin.

21. The SAP will fully assess the impact of economic growth in the region, map out alternative development courses which protect global environmental resources, and will enable the five member states to reach a consensus on priorities, targets, programmes

and projects to prevent and alleviate negative environmental effects. The SAP will include an estimation of the required financial resources and a strategy to mobilize these resources. GEF project proposals to implement the SAP will be prepared using the incremental cost approach. The SAP is expected to play a key role in ensuring that global environmental benefits are provided in tandem with facilitating sustainable and environmentally sound economic development in the area over the coming decades.

22. The preparation of the SAP will be carefully designed to ensure that the SAP is action-oriented, locally owned, government supported, and responsive to the local conditions. This, and the close attention to be paid to mobilizing resources to the SAP, will ensure that it is implemented and not stored on shelves. As a first step for the formulation of the TDA and SAP, the project will strengthen existing mechanisms for regional cooperation in regional, national and local bodies and develop their capacity for project identification, formulation and management. It will also immediately compile, from existing sources, a comprehensive database on international waters and biodiversity in the Region and support an in-depth study on environmental research systems and information systems in the area.

23. The project will rely on a strong participatory approach to formulate the SAP. A series of consultation meetings will be held at the local and grassroots levels to identify environmental priorities, generate and validate information and ensure widespread support to the approaches proposed in the SAP. An awareness-raising programme on transboundary environmental issues will be carried out to prepare the TDA and this will foster local support for the preparation and implementation of the SAP.

24. In addition to providing global environment benefits and shaping the development of the Region into the next century, the capacity built under the project will be of general use to development and environmental management in the Region. In particular, the capacity to cooperate effectively on a regional level will be useful for all future environmental initiatives involving two or more of the concerned countries. Moreover, the databases developed under the project will be of use to many local, national and regional initiatives in both the environmental and economic spheres.

### **III Project Activities, Components and Expected Results**

25. In order to overcome the barriers to collaboration listed above and to prepare a SAP that will be supported by all concerned stakeholders, the following four components are to be implemented:

Component 1 Reinforcing capacities to prepare a SAP for the protection of international waters and biodiversity

Component 2 Preparing Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) and the SAP

Component 3 Designing and implementing an awareness raising programme with particular focus on transboundary environmental issues

Component 4 Strengthening national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP

26. The *Logical Framework Matrix* (Annex 2) provides details of outputs, activities and performance indicators for the above components. All project capacity building activities will be built upon the existing capacity (technical or institutional) in the Region or at the local level. Local, national and international technical expertise will be brought to build this capacity and to assure the technical soundness of all project activities. GEF funds will only be used to support activities that provide global environmental benefits.

**Component 1                    Reinforcing capacities to prepare a SAP for the protection of international waters and biodiversity**

27. This component will strengthen the existing mechanisms for regional cooperation in regional, national and local bodies. The national TRADP Teams and the Environmental Working Groups will be equipped with skills to prepare and implement the SAP. A comprehensive environmental database will be compiled from existing information sources. The database will cover international waters and biodiversity and will focus on regional and transboundary issues. Activities will also include intensive training, coordination meetings, and study tours to see how regions with similar social, economic, political and environmental conditions have addressed development and environment problems.

28. The SAP process will also cooperate with related programmes and projects in the region. Joint workshops will notably be held to exchange information and develop common strategies. Electronic links will also be used for information exchange. Related projects in the Northeast Asia and other regions include UNEP's Northwest Pacific Action Plan, ESCAP's Northeast Asia Region Environment Programme and the IOC's Northeast Asian Regional Global Ocean Observation System.

**Component 2                    Preparing the Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) and the SAP**

29. Two complementary sets of studies will be undertaken to assess the impact of economic growth on globally important environmental resources in the region. First, area-based studies will be undertaken for each of the discrete areas impacted by development in the Region. The studies will address the environmental situation in each area, the environmental trends, the causes of environmental problems, and the requirements for protecting the environment. The outputs will be Area-Based Environmental Country Reports for each country.

30. Sector studies will then be prepared. Themes to be studied will be selected and defined in a participatory manner. A number of studies will focus on the environmental impact of economic sub-sectors in the Region. These studies will illustrate how the sub-sector is impacting the environment across the total area of intervention, and will also illustrate how the sub-sector is dependent on the sustainable supply of natural resources from the Region. Other studies will look at environmental sub-sectors. These studies will analyze the situation in the sub-sector over the total area of intervention. The outputs will be Sector Study Reports for each sector.

31. A series of consultation meetings will be held at the local and grassroots levels to generate and validate information required for these studies and ensure a widespread support to the approaches proposed in the SAP. The Area-Based Environmental Reports and the Sector Study Reports will provide the information necessary to draft the TDA for the Region. The TDA is to be reviewed by local experts and national governments. The TDA will include: (i) a detailed identification of the environmental issues and concerns; (ii) an assessment of the extent to which these are transboundary; and (iii) a causal chain analysis that identifies the immediate and ultimate causes of the issues and concerns.

32. Based on the recommendations of local consultations and inter-country meetings, the project will build on the Area-Based Environmental Reports, the Sector Study Reports and the TDA to prepare the SAP. The SAP will include a prioritizing of global issues and concerns in the area and an evaluation of where interventions can most effectively lead to global benefits. The SAP will also include a financial strategy for its implementation. The SAP will focus on the Tumen River Basin, which includes the near coastal area. Close attention will be paid to ensure that all parties agree with the details in the SAP, and final approval will be by the five governments.

**Component 3                    Designing and implementing an awareness raising programme with particular focus on transboundary environmental issues**

33. The project will prepare an awareness-raising programme (ARP) which pays particular attention to transboundary problems. The ARP will take into account general and country specific conditions and involve target groups. Specialists in communication and social behaviour will lead this process. The ARP will be implemented at the local, national and regional levels. Awareness building materials will be distributed in local languages to decision-makers and stakeholders.

34. The project will also provide seed funding to implement pilot projects in the ARP through a Small Grant Fund that is to be managed by a regional NGO. The project will also mobilize additional resources to implement the ARP by disseminating material and hosting workshops for potential donors. The initial activities implemented under the ARP will be evaluated and the material and the approaches to raising awareness refined accordingly.

35. Raising awareness will facilitate the participation of all concerned communities in the preparation and implementation of the SAP. It will also ensure that all those living, working and investing in the Region are aware of the impact of the development within the Tumen River Basin on the global environment. The awareness raised through the ARP will enable decision-makers to make better and more informed decisions and thereby lessen impact on the global environment.

**Component 4                    Strengthening national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP**

36. As part of the sector studies to be carried out to formulate the TDA and SAP for the Region, the project will in particular focus on strengthening capacity for environmental

research and environmental impact assessment. This component will facilitate the formulation of the SAP, and more importantly strengthen cooperative mechanisms across the five countries and facilitate its implementation.

37. In order to ensure that in the future data is collected in an efficient manner and made accessible to all concerned and interested parties, the project will support a study on environmental research systems and information systems in the area. The project will help experts and officials from the five countries to draft a common programme for the collection, monitoring, analysis, storage and dissemination of data for the region, and to define a long-term financial plan for this programme. The scope of this work will be limited to regional environmental issues with global impacts.

38. A study undertaken in each country will analyze existing legislation relating to EIA and relative environmental standards. Based on this, draft proposals to harmonize EIA across the five countries will be prepared, and draft guidelines for certifying firms to conduct EIAs will be developed. These drafts will be reviewed at a regional workshop with the participation of private sector organizations and then submitted to the TRADP country governments for approval. Given that some activities on EIA will have local and national benefits, the UNDP/TRADP programme will jointly support this work.

#### **IV Risks and Sustainability**

##### **Risks**

39. The project approach to preparing the SAP entails the following principal risks:

*Governments may be slow to meet commitments to regional cooperation, for example in the setting up the institutional mechanisms. This risk is considered Medium-low.*

40. Due to political and administrative constraints in some participating countries, there may be delays in the establishment of cooperative mechanisms and in the approval of project outputs. This could mean that the planning process proceeds more quickly in some countries than in others. However, both in the process leading up to the environmental MOU and during the intensive formulation of this project, all participating countries indicated their commitment to common actions for environmental management, including the elaboration of common policies and strategies for mitigation of environmental hazards.

*The participatory planning approach may be difficult to implement in some countries. This risk is considered Medium-low.*

41. The methodological approach assures and requires a wide involvement of stakeholders in a thorough consultative process. A number of the countries have had little experience in implementing such an approach and may encounter difficulties. For example, disagreements could arise over the choice of participants or the selection of consultants. However, the approach and the scope of work of the SAP have been discussed in depth at the two project formulation workshops (in Vladivostok and Beijing). Also the participatory approach is flexible and is to be adapted to the countries.

*Participating countries might have difficulties in the timely delivery of counterpart contributions and information for the planning process. This risk is considered Low.*

42. Considering administrative and financial constraints, participating countries might not provide, in time, the agreed counterpart contributions (administrative support for organization of meetings and workshops, preparation of sector studies, office facilities, equipment, transport, etc.) and be reluctant, due to administrative inefficiency, to provide necessary data and information. However, the project has the strong commitment of the member governments. In addition, the project uses existing institutional frameworks. For these reasons counterpart contributions should be forthcoming in a timely manner. In order to ensure that information is available, the project makes maximum use of national and local consultants, and uses workshops and meetings as tools to generate information.

### **Risk and Sustainability**

43. The project's sustainability is ensured by the strong commitment of the five governments to the project and its objectives and by the fact that the project uses an existing and well-functioning institutional framework. Financial sustainability is to be ensured by the preparation of a financial strategy for implementing the SAP. The consultative and participatory methodology of the SAP will ensure that it is not an abstract document but that it responds to the grassroots situation and its implementation is feasible. For further information, please see Annex 2, Logical framework matrix.

44. **Government commitment:** Each of the five participating countries has developed a legal and institutional framework for nature conservation and control of environmental degradation and pollution. The five countries are signatories of international conventions to protect biodiversity, international waters and wetlands, among others. These international commitments are reflected in national policies and legal arrangements. Through the signature of the MOU, and the active participation in the formulation process for this project, the participating Governments have demonstrated their strong commitment to taking part in the SAP preparation process and to implementing joint strategies and activities to protect common ecosystems and resources.

45. **Institutional capacities and arrangements:** Within the framework of TRADP, the five participating countries have established institutional mechanisms for economic and environmental cooperation and management. The SAP project will operate through these mechanisms to support the project and ensure the sustainability of project outputs, including implementation of the SAP (more information on the institutional arrangements in the TRADP is provided in Annex 4).

46. **Financial sustainability:** Potential donors will be involved in all stages of the SAP formulation process to ensure that the SAP is responsive to donor requirements. In addition, the SAP will include a detailed financing strategy. The strategy will determine traditional and innovative mechanisms (inter-governmental, governmental, non-

governmental, private and financial institutions) for financing the priority activities identified in the SAP.

## **V Stakeholder Participation and Implementation Arrangements**

### **Stakeholder participation:**

47. The approach to information gathering and planning assures the participation of all stakeholders concerned. At all points, wide consultation and extensive participatory workshops will be encouraged. The project is to ensure the active participation of the following stakeholder groups:

- Respective Governments of the five participating countries, at national and local levels;
- Local communities and population in the respective areas;
- Representatives of civil society, represented by NGOs and other groups of interest (professional associations, syndicates, etc.); and
- Representatives of the donor community, represented by the implementing agencies and other international cooperation organizations.

48. This wide participation of stakeholders will ensure that they not only understand and support the SAP, but that they will ensure their commitment to its implementation. The Public Involvement Plan Summary in Annex 6 provides further details of stakeholder participation during project formulation and proposed under project implementation.

### **Institutional Arrangements**

49. Annex 4 provides further details and a diagram of the institutional framework for the implementation of the SAP. Management at the various levels is described in the following paragraphs:

50. At the international level, the Project will be executed by UNOPS and implemented by UNDP. The UNDP Office in Beijing will assure administrative support and supervision.

51. At the regional Level, the project will build upon the institutional framework put in place for the TRADP. The Regional Environmental Working Group (RWEG) shall guide the project and oversee the planning process. Given the specific requirements of the SAP, composition of the RWEG is to be extended for the project to include representatives from UNDP, the executing agency, the Tumen Secretariat, two NGOs and the SAP CTA. The GEF-SAP Coordinating Unit (SAP Unit) will undertake daily management of the project. The mandate of the SAP Unit is to organize and coordinate the SAP planning process and to ensure a proper financial management of project funds. The SAP Unit will also assist in identifying national and international consultants for the project. The SAP Unit will work closely with the Tumen Secretariat and draw upon its services.

52. National arrangements: The project will build upon the national institutional mechanisms put in place for the TRADP. The TRADP National Teams will take overall responsibility for in-country activities. For the project, composition of the TRADP National Teams is to be extended to include the GEF Focal Points and the national agency for environmental protection. Duties of the Teams will include: approving quarterly work plan; overseeing establishment of the national project offices and mobilization of government inputs; approving international consultants and identifying national consultants; and reviewing and promoting all project outputs.

53. The national Environment Working Groups will provide technical support to the National Teams. For the project, efforts will be made to ensure NGO participation in the Working Group. National SAP Planning Units will be responsible for day-to-day implementation.

54. Where appropriate, and in line with the approaches of the concerned national government, competent NGOs will manage the organization of the local consultation workshops through a sub-contractual arrangement. In addition, a competent regional NGO will be given responsibility for the management of the Small Grant Fund.

## **VI Incremental Costs and Project Financing**

55. The baseline to this project is the TRADP that supports activities for sustainable development at the national and regional levels, and the individual activities of the participating countries to protect the environment in the region.

56. UNDP and other donors have already invested an estimated US\$10 million in the TRADP and recently a second phase UNDP TRADP project for US\$ 3,216,000 was approved. Although it focuses primarily on economic development, the TRADP does support many activities to protect the local environment. A major environmental effort of the TRADP was the set of activities leading up to the signing of the MOU and the establishment of Regional Environmental Working Group and national Environmental Working Groups. In addition, the TRADP has supported workshops and efforts to harmonize EIA processes across the region. The TRADP co-financed the Vladivostok workshop that was the basis for the design of this project.

57. This project will complement the above baseline by supporting activities to prevent and mitigate the impacts on the globally significant environment from the economic development of the Tumen River Basin. There is, as yet, no regional environmental plan, although many issues can only be addressed regionally. The concerned Governments have recognized the need for regional strategies and action plans to address global environmental issues. Despite this recognition, it is unlikely that the participating countries would be in a position to initiate development of a regional strategy or planning process for international waters and biodiversity conservation without GEF support in the near future.

58. Output 4.2 (*Technical and legal conditions for EIA appropriate to the regional context*) has local, regional and global benefits. For this reason the GEF will only cover the incremental costs of harmonizing EIA guidelines and standards - the individual

countries would not do this independently. Hence, US\$ 250,000 of cost-sharing will be used to support non-incremental activities under this output from the UNDP/ROK Trust Fund. This output complements other activities in the region on EIA including the UNDP/ROK/UNIDO environmental impact study of the Hunchun Border Economic Zone for US\$ 150,000 under the TRADP.

### **Cost Effectiveness**

59. The Region has great potential for economic and social development, with an expected investment of billions of dollars in industries, mining, oil exploration, energy, infrastructure and urban development. The importance of environmental protection and management of resources is clear. If economic development is poorly managed it could cause costly damage to the environment, and make such development unsound or unsustainable.

60. The cost-effectiveness of this project lies in the opportunity of preventing transboundary water resource degradation and loss of globally significant biodiversity as a result of the development programme for the Region. At a relatively low cost, this project will help mitigate and alleviate potentially serious damage to a globally important environment.

61. The proposed participatory approach may seem costly compared to work for strategy and project formulation. However, implementation of environmental strategies and actions designed without the participation of the stakeholders receives generally little attention and support, let alone commitment to follow through in their implementation from stakeholders. The result is often reports that stay on shelves or projects that are abandoned during their implementation phase. One of the major objectives of a broad public participation is to mobilize stakeholders and develop a general awareness and common responsibility for environmental protection and sustainable management of resources. Hence, a well-designed and organized participatory planning process will greatly facilitate the implementation of strategies, project and programmes, assuring the adherence of the public to environmental principle. This is expected to prove extremely cost-effectiveness on a medium-term basis.

62. The project will also ensure cost-effectiveness by utilizing existing extensive documentation at the country and regional level. Hence, only minor investments in specific areas are needed to get the overall picture of the environmental condition in the region. However, efforts are needed to adapt available information into compatible formats. The information should also be synthesized to make it accessible to decision-makers.

63. The total cost of the project is estimated at US\$ 10,666,271, of which US\$ 4,957,200 is the estimated incremental cost of the activities to meet global environmental objectives. The total project cost includes US\$ 242,271 of preparatory funds. Please see Incremental Cost Annex (Annex 1) for further details.

<b>Component</b>	<b>Cost to GEF (US\$)</b>
------------------	---------------------------

Reinforcing capacities to prepare a SAP for the protection of international waters.	1,365,000
Preparing the TDA and the SAP.	1,880,000
Designing and implementing an awareness raising programme with particular focus on transboundary environmental issues.	880,000
Strengthening national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP.	465,000
Project support services	367,200
<b>Total</b>	<b>4,957,200</b>

64. The participating countries have agreed to provide in-kind contributions in the form of human, logistical and administrative resources. The baseline estimate of US\$ 5,466,800 is made up of the US\$ 3,216,000 from the TRADP, US\$ 250,000 from the UNDP/ROK Trust Fund, and combined in-kind contribution of the five governments, estimated at US\$2,000,800. The TRADP cost is evidence of UNDP's mainstreaming to this project. The monies from the UNDP/ROK Trust Fund and in-kind contribution from the participating countries are leveraged baseline. Please see Annex 1 for further details.

<b>Government Inputs</b>	<b>Required contribution from each participating country:</b>
National counterparts	Identification of GEF/SAP Focal Point
Support Personnel	Provision of technical and administrative support personnel to the national GEF/SAP Focal Point
Institutional arrangements	See Section V above
Logistical Support	Provision of office space for national GEF/SAP Focal Point, rooms for visiting advisors and consultants, meeting rooms, etc
Provision of information	Identification of national institutions and professionals to provide information and work with SAP consultants;
Support for organization of Consultation Meetings and Workshops	Provision of meeting rooms and conference centers, organization of meetings and workshops, selection of participants following agreed procedures and active participation of government officials from national and local levels.
Support for missions of national and international consultants and working groups	Efficient organization of missions (travel arrangements, appointments, etc.), arranging accommodation, etc.; Ensure adequate logistical arrangements and financing of government counterparts

Information system Identification of appropriate institutional arrangements, provision of logistical support (office space for installation of national environmental information system), identification of human resources (national professionals and support personnel) to work with international consultants.

## **VII Monitoring, Evaluation and Dissemination**

65. The logical framework for the project includes performance indicators, and will be further detailed before the project inception. It will also serve as the master tool for monitoring project progress, impact and achievement of project objectives and outputs. The project team will prepare quarterly work plans. These work plans will identify activities for the quarter and illustrate how the activities are contributing optimally towards the project objectives. At the end of each quarter, the project team will provide a report describing the progress made on each activity in the work plans, the efficiency of the completed activities, and a brief description of overall progress towards the project objectives. The project team will provide regular progress reports to the five governments, UNDP and the executing agency.

66. In line with UNDP procedures, the project will be subject to tripartite review at least every twelve months. On these occasions, the CTA shall prepare a Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) and shall formulate recommendations for adjustments of strategies and activities. The members of the RWEG shall meet to evaluate project performance and make decisions regarding the continuation and/or adjustments of activities.

67. Review/monitoring meetings can also be organized at the request of the CTA or of one of the participating countries. The Consultative Commission of the TRADP, upon recommendation of the RWEG, shall approve the final result at a terminal joint review meeting.

68. Some important lessons have been learned from the on-going UNDP TRADP project. First is the importance of setting up institutional arrangements that are acceptable to all parties concerned. Second is the need to avoid the difficult and time consuming procedures of establishing new inter-governmental bodies by employing the overall TRADP framework already put in place. Third is the need for information transfer to the local level. Currently, the local governments in the Region feel that they are poorly informed about new initiatives proposed at the regional and national levels. SAP institutional structures are to facilitate information flow between national and local levels. Also, efforts will be made by the SAP Unit to ensure that all parties, including government at all levels and all key stakeholders are duly informed about the progress of the SAP activities.

69. Experience, in particular from Africa and Latin America, shows that participatory planning involving all key stakeholders can be applied with success and can greatly facilitate the implementation of proposed initiatives. In line with this, the proposed

planning process is participatory. However, it is recognized that participatory approaches will have to be adapted to local circumstances.

70. The project design includes the communication of all project findings to all concerned and interested parties. Many activities in the project target the two-way communication of information. These include consultation meetings, awareness campaigns, conferences with regional and donor governments, and Internet connections. These activities, in addition to standard GEF, UNDP and executing agency procedures will assure an effective and wide dissemination of project findings.

### **STAP Review**

71. The STAP reviewer's comments are fully incorporated into this project brief (please see Annex 3). For example, output 1.1 includes the preparation of a 'road map' for the collection of data required for the various studies (please see Annex 2). This will involve a more detailed analysis of on how to obtain relevant and comparable data. The sectoral workshops will include discussion and analysis of cross-sectoral issues to demonstrate the inter-linkages between the water-related environmental issues and the root causes of the impacts of the sectoral activities under consideration. In addition to the sectoral studies, one or two cross-sectoral studies, as appropriate, will be prepared. The study tour(s) is an eligible activity under the preparation of a SAP, and is one of the outputs of the IW: LEARN project.

72. During the PDF Block B, the original timeframe for the preparation of the SAP was three years. However, at the final workshop in Beijing, there was an in-depth discussion on the timeframe for the preparation of the SAP, and it was agreed by all participating countries that it was realistically feasible to carry it out within two years. Much work has already been undertaken, particularly by the current UNDP TRADP project to build up capacity.

## Annexes

### 1. Incremental Cost Analysis

### 2. Logical Framework Matrix

### 3. STAP Roster Technical Review

### 4. TRADP Institutional Arrangements and Implementation Framework

This Annex explains the institutional arrangements made by the participating governments for the implementation of the Tumen River area Development Programme and for the GEF SAP project. An outline of the Consultative Commission and Coordination Committee, as well as the Environmental Working Group is provided. An outline of the major consultations which took place during the preparatory phase of the project is also provided. (Available upon request)

### 5. Root Causes

The root causes of the threats to the environment within the system boundary of the project are described. Background on the socio-economic development and its adverse effects on the environment is provided. This annex also explains how the principal barriers to protecting global environmental resources in the Tumen region is the lack of cooperative mechanisms and a lack of consensus on policies, among others. (Available upon request)

### 6. Public Involvement Plan Summary

This annex identifies the important stakeholders involved in the project and the intensive consultation process required to implement the project. (Available upon request)

### 7. Maps of the Project Area (Available upon request)

Map 1 Tumen River Area Watershed

Map 2 Main Sources of Industrial Water Pollution in the Tumen River Area

Map 3 Existing and Proposed Protected Areas

Map 4 Map of Northeast Asia: GEF Strategic Action Programme Intervention Areas

Map 5 Protected Areas or Proposed Protected Areas in the Tumen River Area

Map 6 Main Sources of Air Pollution in Yanbian Prefecture in 1995

Map 7 Map Showing Major Cities of the Tumen River Economic Development Area (TREDA)

## **Annex 1: Incremental Cost Analysis**

### **Broad Development Goal**

The broad development goal of this project is to ensure that industrial and urban development of the Tumen River Economic Development Area progresses sustainably and in an environmentally friendly manner. This project will also address the protection of the Tumen River Basin in that much of the development will take place there. At the same time, the project will ensure the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity resources, and in particular the unique and globally significant biological resources.

### **Baseline**

Rapid economic growth in the region has resulted in the pollution of the Tumen River, depletion of natural resources, disruption of migration pattern of some rare species and conversion of wetlands, among other impacts. Constraints in legislation and setting of environmental standards, inadequate scientific data exchange and lack of public awareness and participation in planning process hinder efforts at both the national and regional levels. In each participating country, a number of globally important protected areas have been established, but the limited human capacity is unable to ensure effective management of these areas. Each participating country is implementing its own environmental protection programmes. However, the single-country approach is not sufficient to achieve global environmental benefits in the region. Present efforts are oriented towards achieving national environmental benefits and economic growth continues to pose an increasing threat to the shared ecology of the region.

The baseline for this project is effectively the Tumen River Area Development Programme (TRADP), which has as its goal to create an enabling environment for investment in the Tumen River Basin and its Northeast Asian Environs. It supports activities for sustainable development at the national and regional levels; however, it does not provide global environmental benefits. A series of surveys and consultations were undertaken under the auspices of the TRADP, which culminated in the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Principles governing the Tumen River Economic Area and Northeast Asia by the five participating states on 6 December 1995. Under the MOU, governments are to coordinate and cooperate in the protection of the region's environment, to exchange data, carry out EIAs, improve public participation, seek external funding and harmonization of standards. These activities, however, have not yet been implemented under the TRADP.

Phase I of the TRADP focused on the establishment of the legal and institutional framework for future cooperation between the member countries and on carrying out a range of general studies. These studies dealt with issues such as infrastructure, telecommunications, water resources, forestry and tourism. Phase I was completed in October 1994 and was followed by an interim phase. This interim phase was devoted to achieving the endorsement of the international legal agreements and the MOU on Environmental Principles. The interim phase also focused on investment promotion, measures to harmonize rules, regulation and procedures affecting the free flow of goods and peoples, and carrying out feasibility studies and identification of bankable projects.

Phase II was approved in November 1997 to:

- Support the work of the Consultative Commission and Coordination Committee;
- Mobilize resources for projects of national and regional concern by assisting the governments to promote, coordinate and support initiatives for public and private national and international investment in the five countries of the Region;
- Harmonization of cross-border trade and passenger flow practices within the Tumen River Basin and elimination of cross-border impediments to traffic, trade and tourism;
- Support the implementation of the MOU on Environmental Principles; and
- Encourage the improvement of existing bilateral cooperation between member governments, particularly at the provincial and local levels.

### **Global environmental objectives**

This project is a result of the participating countries' commitment to address the threats to prevent damage to the transboundary environmental resources. The global environmental objective being pursued is to improve sectoral policies and activities that are responsible for the most serious root causes of priority transboundary environmental concerns of the Tumen River Basin. There is also globally significant biodiversity that is of transboundary nature, such as the migratory gazelles that range from Russia through Mongolia through to China. There are other endemic and endangered species that are likely to be affected, such as the Siberian Tiger, Amur Leopard and several species of crane. This project will create the necessary conditions and framework for concerted actions to protect globally important environmental resources. This project falls under the GEF integrated land and water multiple focal area operational programme No. 9. The protection of the Tumen River Economic Development Area and the Northeast Asian environs requires the integration of sound land and water resource management strategies. In order to achieve this objective, biodiversity conservation beyond the Tumen River Basin must also be addressed. This and the unique transboundary biodiversity that is tied to the Tumen River Basin demonstrate the strong ties to the GEF biodiversity focal area, and in particular the coastal, marine and freshwater ecosystem operational programme No. 2.

### **GEF project activities**

Under the alternative GEF scenario, the development processes and forces are re-shaped in order to safeguard the globally important environment. The two main reports of this project would be a) the preparation of a Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) to address the globally significant biodiversity issues within the system boundary of the project and b) the preparation of a Strategic Action Programme (SAP) for the protection of the Tumen River Basin.

In particular, the project will provide technical assistance to strengthen both national and regional capacities for the preparation of the TDA and SAP and even more importantly to implement the SAP. The SAP will ensure the cost-effectiveness of joint efforts made by the participating countries. In addition, cooperative programmes in

data sharing and legislative reforms will be conducted to enhance regional collaboration to implement the SAP.

The incremental cost of alternative activities of this project will ensure that all plans and investments will be designed with global environmental considerations in mind. For example, trans-frontier railways will be re-designed or re-located so as not to threaten biodiversity, and industrial zones will be re-designed or re-located so as to minimize impact on globally important environmental resources. The database will enable planners at all levels to clearly establish global priorities for action and prepare plans accordingly. A common database covering all the participating countries will also ensure that regulators and investors have the data to undertake full EIAs, accounting for globally important environment resources residing in neighbouring countries. For example, investors/designers of a power plant will have the data available to avoid degrading the global environment.

A better understanding of environment-economy link will allow for improved strategic EIA in the region. Henceforth, economic policies, programmes and sector plans will adequately account for globally important environmental resources. For example the cross-border transport development plan can be strategically assessed, and its impact on global environment mitigated. Standardizing EIA guidelines and procedures will mean that EIAs in each country in the region would cover globally important environmental resources. Through this project, there should also be a strong incentive in each country to fully enforce the guidelines, a reduced danger of environmentally unsound projects implemented in one of the participating countries.

This project has leveraged approximately US\$ 2,000,800 from governments to finance the identification of GEF/SAP focal points, provide logistical support and personnel, set-up institutional arrangements, sourcing of information, and support for consultations, meetings and missions. The participating states have provided estimates of their in-kind contribution to the project as follows:

China	US\$ 450,000
DPRK	US\$ 400,000
Mongolia	US\$ 350,800
Russia	US\$ 450,000
<u>ROK</u>	<u>US\$ 350,000</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>US\$ 2,000,800</b>

### **System boundary**

The area of intervention is the hydrological catchment basin of the Tumen River as regards the international waters component, and beyond this catchment basin to the include the Tumen River Economic Development Area and its Northeast Asian Environs as regards biodiversity. The participating countries include Russia, DPR Korea and China, which are riparian states of the Tumen River Basin, and Mongolia and RO Korea which are participating states of the TRED A. The area of intervention specifically includes the international waters of TRED A which are the Tumen River and all of its

tributaries, and Peter the Great Bay. Analysis and remedial actions will also be associated with land-based activities of the participating countries. Please see map.

### Incremental cost matrix

Costs - Benefits	Baseline (B)	Alternative (A)	Increment (A -B)
<u>Domestic Benefits</u>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. National action plans and strategies are not sufficient to meet regional priorities for environmental protection within the TREDA region.</li> <li>2. Countries' capacity in environmental management is weak.</li> <li>3. Countries are bearing increasing socio-economic costs from depletion of natural resources and pollution of the catchment area in the TREDA.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Coordinate national efforts to conduct collaborative activities in the region for environmental protection consistent with regional development plans.</li> <li>2. Conduct training and exchange experience among countries in environmental management.</li> <li>3. Identify root causes of environmental degradation and design action programme to remove them.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. National environmental endeavors will facilitate environmental protection consistent with regional development priorities.</li> <li>2. Capacities to formulate and implement environmental management strategy will be strengthened.</li> <li>3. Root causes of environmental degradation identified and action programme to remove them designed.</li> </ol>

<p><b><u>Global - Regional Benefits</u></b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Community and general public participation in planning process is limited.</li> <li>2. A Memorandum of Understanding on Environmental Principles Governing the TREDAs signed by all five participating countries.</li> <li>3. Understanding of linkages between environmental protection and economic development in the region is limited.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Raise awareness of the decision-makers and all stakeholders in transboundary environmental issues.</li> <li>2. Compile a comprehensive database covering international waters and biodiversity, with a focus on regional and transboundary issues; coordinate consultations among countries to facilitate the implementation of the MOU.</li> <li>3. Assess the impacts of economic growth on globally important environmental resources in the region</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Improved awareness built among all stakeholders, facilitating an adequate planning process and wider public support to implement the SAP.</li> <li>2. Improved database that facilitates the development of a general agreement on future regional cooperative plans in international waters and biodiversity protection and implementation of the environmental MOU.</li> <li>3. Understanding of the environmental situation and requirement for environmental protection and biodiversity conservation in the region will be improved. This will facilitate more effective planning and sensitized decision-makers.</li> </ol>
---	--	---	---

<b>Global - Regional Benefits</b> (cont.)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Regional cooperative mechanism of scientific data sharing in environmental resource protection is weak.</li> <li>5. Existing legislation relating to EIAs and environmental standards are inadequate.</li> <li>6. Finance for global environmental initiatives are limited in the region.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Study environmental research systems and information systems in the area; prepare common programme for data analysis and dissemination, and design related financial plan.</li> <li>5. Develop proposals to harmonize EIA among the participating countries and prepare guidelines for conducting EIAs.</li> <li>6. Estimate the required financial resources and prepare a strategy to mobilize these resources.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Technical basis for regional cooperation on international waters and biodiversity protection will be established.</li> <li>5. Legislative basis will be strengthened, and where necessary established to enhance cooperation for the implementation of SAP.</li> <li>6. Cohesive strategy developed to ensure the financial needs for the implementation of the SAP.</li> </ol>
--	--	--	---

Costs (US\$)	Baseline Costs	Alternative Costs	Incremental costs
<b>Component 0:</b> Mobilize resources and harmonize cross-border activities	1,704,600	1,704,600	0
<b>Component 1:</b> Reinforce capacities to prepare a SAP for the protection of international waters	1,443,400	2,808,400	1,365,000
<b>Component 2:</b> Prepare the TDA and SAP, including the identification of the baseline and alternative/incremental actions	689,600	2,569,600	1,880,000
<b>Component 3:</b> Design and implement an awareness-raising programme with particular focus on transboundary environmental issues	689,600	1,569,600	880,000
<b>Component 4:</b> Strengthen national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP.	939,600	1,404,600	465,000
<i>Sub-total (US\$)</i>	5,466,800	10,056,800	4,590,000
<i>Project support services (US\$)</i>	0	367,200	367,200
<b>Total (US\$)</b>	5,466,800	10,424,000	4,957,200
<i>Preparatory funds (US\$)</i>		242,271	242,271
<b>Total Project Cost (US\$)</b>		10,666,271	5,199,471

### Annex 2: Logical Framework Matrix

Intervention Logic	Indicators of Performance (qualitative and quantitative)	Source of Verification	Risks and Assumptions
The long-term objective of the project is to protect globally important environmental resources in the Tumen River Area, its related coastal areas and its Northeast Asian environs through the preparation of a SAP for International Waters and Biodiversity Protection.	Maintenance of species and ecosystem diversity in the project sites  Maintained or improved levels of key pollutants  Maintained or improved levels of key fish species	Surveys of numbers and ranges of key species (animals and birds)  Measurements from local laboratories  Local measuring stations	Continued economic development of the 5 member countries  Sustainable development at the national level continues
<b>Objective 1</b> Reinforced Capacities to prepare an Environmental Strategic Action Programme (SAP) for Protection of International Waters and Biodiversity	Governments take joint decisions regarding approaches/activities for environmental management  Regular transborder cooperation by local governments	Minutes of meetings  Press releases; governmental decisions  Interviews	Continued good political relations in the region
Output 1.1 Mechanisms for regional cooperation in environmental management at regional, national and local levels.	Efficient project management framework (road map prepared) Comprehensive and accessible database for the project area	Executing agency reports Project records Internet	All information is available; it is not sensitive for military or political reasons
Output 1.2 National TRADP Teams and the Environmental Working Groups equipped with skills to prepare and implement the SAP.	Trained cadres in the five countries Effective <i>Working Groups</i> 1 equipped laboratory serving all five countries	Reports of working groups Interviews Site visit, laboratory publishes results	Good trainers can be identified Suitable study tours can be arranged Suitable mechanisms to share the laboratory resources can be found
Output 1.3 Cooperation and coordination with other programmes and projects for environmental protection are established.	Database covering all related projects Results and findings of all projects are exchanged	Internet Project records Interviews with staff of other projects	Other projects cooperate Other projects allocate necessary resources to cooperation.
<b>Objective 2</b> Preparation of a Trans-Boundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) and of an Environmental Strategic Action Programme (SAP)	Full consensus on the programme to protect the global environment resources in the region.  The SAP receives full support from the five governments and all concerned stakeholders	Project records Records of official agreements to support SAP projects Local government budgets Interviews with local community representatives	Continued political development in the area. The SAP's financing strategy is successful and meets no unforeseen obstacles.

Intervention Logic	Indicators of Performance (qualitative and quantitative)	Source of Verification	Risks and Assumptions
Output 2.1 An agreed methodological approach and scope for the preparation of the TDA and the SAP	Full understanding and agreement to the planning methodology, work plan and organizational structure.	Minutes to consultation meetings  Workshop reports Interviews with local population	All governments, national and local, accept the proposed participatory approach. Local communities have necessary skills to participate in planning process.
Output 2.2 Area-based Environmental Report prepared in each participating country.	For each country, a Government approved, technically sound, report covering all project zones.  Local community support for the report	Project records; reports publicly available  Interviews	Full involvement and support of governmental, scientific, academic and local communities.  All necessary information is obtainable in an up-to-date, usable format.
Output 2.3 Sector Study Reports prepared, edited and printed.	For at least 10 economic or environment sub-sectors, a comprehensive, technically sound report covering the total project area, and approved by all five countries  Local community support for the report	Project records; reports publicly available  Interviews	Full involvement and support of governmental, scientific, academic and local communities.  All necessary information is obtainable in an up-to-date, usable format.
Output 2.4 A Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA) (in line with GEF requirements for a TDA).	The TDA covering all five countries, approved by all Governments  Local community support for the TDA	Project records  Interviews	No major disagreements between participating governments regarding sources and impacts of environmental degradation.
Output 2.5 A regional Strategic Action Programme (SAP) edited and printed (in line with GEF requirements for a TDA).	SAP, based on comprehensive and scientific TDA, approved by all five member governments Support for the SAP from the local and international communities Baseline and additional action identified and financially quantified	Press releases, signed documents  Interviews  Donors expressing interest in supporting the SAP in writing	Current government commitment is maintained
<b>Objective 3</b> Design and Implementation of an awareness raising programme (ARP) with particular focus on Trans-boundary environmental issues.	Investors and decision makers in TREDAs understand environment-economy links, and the impact of TREDAs development on global environment	Surveys?  Findings from project evaluation of programme	Suitable awareness raising techniques can be adapted to local conditions

<b>Intervention Logic</b>	<b>Indicators of Performance (qualitative and quantitative)</b>	<b>Source of Verification</b>	<b>Risks and Assumptions</b>
Output 3.1 A programme for environmental awareness raising targeting country specific issues and target groups.	ARP, matched to local conditions, approved by national and local governments  Non-project resources mobilized to support the ARP	Project records  Signed financial agreements with other financiers	Continued support and commitment from local and national governments
Output 3.2 The ARP is implemented at local and national levels and the results of the pilot phase are analyzed.	ARP is successful  Recommendations for improving awareness raising techniques	Project records  Evaluation report	Donors to the ARP can efficiently mobilize resources
Output 3.3 The implementation of a Small Grants Programme for community based environmental protection reinforces public awareness raising activities and participation.	Small grants fund established and supporting projects  \$400,000 allocated to awareness raising activities through Small Grant Funds	Project records  Records of the Small Grants management committee	An effective way to manage the Fund can be found, and a competent fund manager identified
<b>Objective 4</b> Strengthened national and regional capacities to jointly implement the Strategic Action Programme (SAP)	Strong cooperative mechanisms amongst expert communities and local officials on EIA, research and data management.	Project records	Agreement can be quickly reached across all five countries
Output 4.1 An environmental research and information system for TREDAs, its related coastal areas and its Northeast Asian environs	Jointly research mechanisms operationalized Comprehensive information sources compatible and accessible across all borders	Project records Internet	Cooperation from existing research and environmental information centres
Output 4.2 Technical and legal conditions for environmental impact assessment (EIA) appropriate to the regional context are applied.	Harmonized EIA procedures and standards in the project area covering all five countries	Legislation Project records	No major disagreements on standards amongst the five countries develop. Existing EIA procedures are comparable

#### Activities :

- 1.1.1. Recruit technical assistance team.
- 1.1.2. Establish GEF-SAP Coordination Unit, including purchase of equipment;
- 1.1.3. Establish a SAP Planning Unit in each country under the national TRADP Coordinating Offices, including purchase of equipment;
- 1.1.4. Identify existing sources of information and compile a comprehensive environmental database.
- 1.1.5. In close cooperation with all stakeholders, compile roster of national experts from the region.
- 1.2.1. Draft Training Programme for the members of the National TRADP Teams and Environmental Working Groups, including details of training institutions;
- 1.2.2. Hold orientation courses in each participating country concerning the methodological approach and the planning system for preparing the TDA and the SAP;
- 1.2.3. Organize study tour(s) to other related projects concerning biodiversity protection and international waters management;
- 1.2.4. Procure equipment (measuring/laboratory equipment) to conduct complementary field investigation concerning water pollution and biodiversity issues.

- 1.3.1. Prepare database on all ongoing, related programmes, projects and activities in the region and in other comparable regions;
- 1.3.2. Establish links and exchange information (e.g., through Internet) with related programmes, projects and activities;
- 1.3.3. Organize joint workshops to exchange information and to develop common strategies for environmental management and problem solving
- 1.3.4. Invite identified institutions and projects to participate in the SAP planning activities to be supported by the project.
- 2.1.1 Identify all stakeholders concerned with the SAP and provide them with relevant information on biodiversity and international waters in the project area;
- 2.1.2. Draft and distribute guidelines on Target Oriented Planning<sup>2</sup> workshops to governments, NGOs, donors and other stakeholders;
- 2.1.3. Invite participants from national and local government, international organizations and other key stakeholders to participate in a planning workshop ;
- 2.1.4. Hold the planning workshop, using Target Oriented Planning methodology, to: determine the participatory approach for area-based planning and sector planning; define the scope of work and areas of intervention; define the work plan and the institutional arrangements for undertaking preparing the TDA and SAP.
- 2.1.5. Disseminate the Target Oriented Planning workshop report, including agreed work plan and agreed organizational structure for planning activities at all levels ;
- 2.1.6. Organize a consultative Donor Conference to present approach and work plan for preparing the TDA and the SAP;
- 2.2.1. Recruit national/local consultant teams to prepare background papers addressing particular area-related environmental issues in the project area;
- 2.2.2. On a country basis, when requested by the government, sub-contract an NGO to organize Consultation Meetings at the national or local level with participation from government (regional and local) and key stakeholders (NGOs, professional associations, scientific institutions, etc.) in order to discuss environmental issues related to particular ecological zones or regions.
- 2.2.3. Hold national Target Oriented Planning Workshops to analyze environmental problems of specific ecological zones and to determine strategies and actions for sustainable environmental management of local ecosystems and resources.
- 2.2.4. For each zone, draft a Portfolio of projects of global importance. The proposed portfolio should identify priorities, it should take into account estimation of baseline and incremental cost, as well as a description of projects which may be eligible for GEF small grants programme or other sources of financial assistance (45 m/m of national/local consultancy, 2 m/m of international expertise);
- 2.2.5. Finalize and distribute Area-Based Environmental Reports.
- 2.3.1. Write terms of reference and hire international and national consultants to prepare, organize and conduct trans-boundary and sector studies.
- 2.3.2. Elaborate transboundary and sector studies which may cover the following fields of immediate environmental concern: Analysis of forest, wetland and grassland resources, their sustainable management and protection of biodiversity; Protection of endangered species and management of protected areas; Protection and management of inland waters and its resources (water supply and demand forecasting, pollution control, sedimentation, flooding, catchment area degradation); Protection of coastal and marine ecosystems and management of its resources; Evaluation of specific strategic opportunities concerning promotion of waste minimization, promotion of ISO 14000, broad screening of waters to detect hazardous substances, etc.; Environmental issues in urban development (solid and liquid waste disposal, sanitation, etc.) and their effects on biodiversity and international waters; Environmental issues in relation to economic development (degradation and pollution of soil, water and air caused by industry, mining, transport, energy, agriculture, forest exploitation, etc.).
- 2.3.3. Elaborate sector studies assessing the impact of the following on the environment and natural resources (16 m/m national/regional consultancy and 4 m/m of international expertise): population growth and urban development; global and national economic condition; infrastructure, transport and communication development, drinking water and energy demand and supply, agriculture (food supply) and forest management; the legal and institutional framework at national and regional levels.
- 2.3.4 Organize 7 sector workshops to involve the public and all key stakeholders in the preparation of sector studies, e.g., on water and/or air pollution due to industrial, mining, transport and agricultural activities, urban development, etc.
- 2.3.5. Edit and print Sector Study Reports
- 2.4.1. Based of the Area-Based Environmental Reports and the Sector Study Reports, draft the TDA taking into account the following analytical steps: identification of issue; assessment of transboundary effects; assessment of effects and identification of problems related to transboundary management of biodiversity and natural resources

<sup>2</sup>) The methodological approach relies on equal participation of all members of the workshop and uses visualization as an element for consensus building. The workshop activities follow a logical frame of analysis, identifying causes and effects of environmental problems, determining objectives and corresponding actions to solve problems and/or to assure sustainable development of resources. Ideally 25 professionals from government and civil society with specific knowledge on environmental issues would participate for about 6 days. Methodological and technical guidance will be provided by planning specialists. The result of the workshop depends on the quality and the attention of the participants.

in the Tumen River Area, its related coastal regions and its Northeast Asian environs.

2.4.2 Hold workshop to evaluate the TDA, wide range of participants to include observers from national and international organizations, universities, research institutions, and technical cooperating agencies.

2.4.3 Identify a list of transboundary project profiles addressing global environmental issues.

2.4.4. Finalize and distribute Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis

2.5.1 Review proposed project Portfolios (see Activity 2.2.4 and 2.4.3) and prepare a compilation of proposed investments by sector and country, identify baseline contribution and assess incremental cost for projects eligible for GEF financial support, identify other sources of financial support

2.5.2 Review possible financial mechanisms, including private sector, governmental, ODA and other innovative mechanisms, for supporting SAP.

2.5.3 Organize Regional Planning Workshop for preparation of SAP, focusing on policies, strategies and actions, using a participatory logical framework approach (LFA).

2.5.4 Draft the SAP report and investment programme and submit it to participating governments, donors and cooperating agencies for review and comments. The SAP should include: An assessment of priority problems and concerns relating to international waters and biodiversity; An identification of the interventions likely to be most effective in addressing the problems and concerns; A strategy for financing SAP implementation covering ODA, domestic governmental, community-based, private sector and other sources of funding.

2.5.5 On a country basis, when requested by the government, contract an NGO to organize Consultation Meetings at the national or local level with participation from government (regional and local) and key stakeholders (NGOs, professional associations, scientific institutions, etc.) to discuss the draft SAP.

2.5.6 Hold Intergovernmental Consultation Meeting to review and approve the regional SAP

2.5.7 Hold International Donor Conference to present the TDA and SAP.

3.1.1 Hire specialists to study awareness raising with particular attention to transboundary problems, considering general and country specific issues and target groups;

3.1.2 Recruit national consultants, including specialists in communication and social behaviour, to work on the preparation of the awareness raising programme.

3.1.3 Prepare programme for environmental awareness raising to be implemented at local, national and regional levels.

3.2.1 Circulate the awareness raising programme (from 3.1.3) to various donors for additional funding;

3.2.2 Identify national institutions for programme execution (educational institutions, mass media, NGOs, professional association, people's governments and groups, etc.);

3.2.3 Produce awareness building materials in local languages for decision makers and for the common users of the environment;

3.2.4 Disseminate materials and launch education and awareness building campaigns ;

3.2.5 Analyze results of pilot phase, propose adjustments when necessary and make recommendations for future awareness raising activities.

3.3.1 Establish management structure and define criteria of project selection (including contribution to global environment) for the Small Grants Programme.

3.3.2 Select projects eligible for funding taking into account recommendations from National Planning Workshops (2.2.3);

3.3.3 Release funds to support selected activities, evaluate activities and results in terms of technical gains and increased public awareness and participation;

3.3.4 Analyze results of pilot phase, propose adjustments when necessary and make recommendations for future Small Grants Programmes.

4.1.1 Identify government focal points for the environmental research and information systems; hire consultants and initiate studies on research and information systems;

4.1.2 Carry out, in each participating country, a study on environmental research systems, assess role and contribution of scientific research in environmental protection and management of resources, identify existing research capacities, develop operational research programme, harmonize research activities and identify measures to strengthen research and environmental technology development.

4.1.3 Carry out, in each participating country, a study on environmental information systems, identify needs and potential users of information, identify sources of information and establish appropriate system for collection, analytical processing and circulation of information to users in government and private sectors.

4.1.4 Establish environmental information system, connect to international sources (Internet) and make information system operational at all levels of countries.

4.1.5 Determine financial mechanisms for the long term financing of the environmental research and information system.

#### **And in collaboration with TRADP:**

4.2.1 Write TORs and identify national and international consultants for a study on harmonization of EIA standards and procedural arrangements;

4.2.2 Conduct study in each participating country on EIA. The study should: analyze existing legislation for conduct of EIA and relative environmental standards in participating countries; elaborate proposals for harmonization or equivalent indicators; prepare recommendation for certification of firms to conduct EIA, propose effective control mechanisms;

4.2.3 Under TRADP initiative, organize one regional workshop with private sector participation to review findings of 4.2.2;

4.2.4 Submit proposed standards and regulations for conduct of EIA to governments of participating countries.

**Preparation of a Strategic Action Programme (SAP) for the Tumen River Coastal Area and related Northeast Asian Environs.** Proposed UNDP/GEF Biodiversity/International Waters project

*STAP-Roster Independent Technical Review undertaken by*

*Dr Gunilla Björklund  
Marmorvägen 16A  
S-752 44 Uppsala, SWEDEN*

-----

## **1. Overall impressions**

The overall impressions of the project are very positive. The area is in the early stages of a large-scale development that will pose severe threats on the environment, its unique biodiversity, including several endangered species, both in terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems and its transboundary river basin area and the nearby coastal and marine areas. As is stated in the documentation this gives a unique possibility as the SAP therefore can be design to prevent rather than cure the area, which would in the long-run mean a less costly procedure.

As the project also to a large extent will take advantage of an existing institutional structure the provisions for a less costly and more efficient structure are good. This will also imply a good basis for co-operation between participating governments and other stake-holders.

A SAP for the area should give the means for future interventions to be undertaken within a more integrated framework, which is necessary in obtaining global benefits.

## **2. Relevance and priority**

The project would be of great importance as it relates to the a/i/ *International Waters Operational Strategy* as the SAP clearly would increase the possibilities to prevent the area from degradation of the quality of the transboundary water resources; as well as prevent from physical habitat degradation of coastal and near-shore marine areas and watercourses;

a/ii/ *Biologic Diversity Operational Strategy* as the SAP would increase awareness of the ecosystems including the unique species and the possibilities to protect them. With a carefully developed SAP, any project undertaken within its framework would also contribute to the sustainable use of biodiversity. The project description emphasizes biodiversity conservation but according to the GEF Operational Strategy and the CBD, sustainable use is as important. It is important that the SAP also includes options for the sustainable use of the biodiversity, not least to convince local people that this would imply protecting ecosystems including their endangered species, while serving human interests.

b/ The main relevant international environmental convention is the *Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)*, and as the GEF operational strategy in biological diversity incorporates the policy guidance of the COP to the CBD (a/ii/) is relevant also under this item.

Another international environmental convention of relevance for this project is the *Ramsar Convention on Wetlands*, that has initiated collaboration with the CBD in the implementation of

CBD activities related to wetlands. As wetlands are important parts of the downstream area of the Tumen catchment area it is important to relate to that convention in undertaking the project. *c/ National/regional priorities* are likely to be appropriately regarded in the TDA and SAP processes as the national governments as well as local representation will be actively participating. It is important that national as well as local representatives are also actively participating both in designing and implementing the SAP.

### **3. Project approach**

The approach of the project is in general appropriate, taking advantage of the ongoing UNDP project and to a large extent emphasising capacity building among the people involved by conducting several workshops. It is important that the procedure strives at involving national and local representatives in every step, as they are the ones, who will implement the strategy.

The approach to collect relevant information on sectors of society, on economic sectors and on different aspects of the environment, different aspects of water management (water availability and use for different sectors, water demand and demand forecast of unsustainable use, water quantity and water quality) and on different ecosystem is valuable. It is however important to clearly define the purposes of the data collection. A distinct plan ("road map") for the data needed and the purpose should be drawn. This plan would be the framework for the SAP. The project brief is somewhat unclear on the criteria to be used to specify the data needed, both when describing the "Area-based" studies and the "sector" studies. This needs to be specified both in the project document and in the SAP.

Nowhere in the project brief is any cross-sectoral analysis described as part of the SAP. The SAP need to include a discussion, analysis and conclusion on the inter-linkages between water-related environmental issues and the root causes behind different concerns. This might be included in the "causal chain analysis" but needs to be emphasized as key part of the approach of the SAP. If an integrated approach to the concerns caused by different sectors is not applied a full analysis of the causal chain is not possible and the Strategic Action Programme might lose part of the long-term strategic approach.

### **4. Objectives**

a/ The objectives, to reinforce capacity to prepare a SAP, to prepare a TDA and a SAP, to design and implement an awareness raising programme, and to strengthen national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP, are very relevant, particularly as they are addressing the national capacities.

b and c/ The objectives are focused and would be able to achieve given the outlined activities even though the time indicated looks too short, particularly as it is somewhat unclear to what extent relevant and compatible data can be obtained.

d/ See partly above. I also have difficulties in seeing the relevance of study tours to the projects in the Danube River Basin etc. even though TDA:s and SAP:s are prepared for those project areas. A thoroughly prepared training programme is of more relevance.

### **5. Background and justification**

The background and justification for the project is part of the ongoing UNDP Tumen River Area Development Programme and otherwise well provided in the documentation. Nothing of great importance for the justification has been omitted and it is most certainly more detailed in the actual project proposal. The presentation of the current situation, threats, global environmental benefits, incremental costs, degree of threat, likelihood of success, cost-effectiveness, existing institutional capacity and needs are all clearly and compellingly presented. To this is also added terms for Monitoring and Evaluation, which is a necessary part of a project. The presentation is partly short, due to the nature of the document, but anyhow compelling.

## **6. Critical analysis of the situation**

The situation has been analyzed, although some of the details are most probably contained in the existing results of the ongoing UNDP programme and therefore just briefly stated in this document. This includes the analysis of the system effects and externalities. Root causes and symptoms are addressed but not in any detail.

## **7. Activities**

As commented above I do question the relevance for the study tours to European project sites. Otherwise the activities seem relevant to achieve the objectives, which are in a logic sequence.

I am, however, missing an important activity. When preparing a TDA and an SAP it is important not just to hold workshops with local participation on transboundary and sector studies with reference to environment and to the impact of different sectors (as specified) on the environment and natural resources. It is as important to address the cross-sectoral approach, both at local and national/regional level. The people concerned need to be aware of the causal chain behind different concerns to act accordingly. This needs to be emphasized in the document.

Also, of course a more detailed analysis on how to obtain relevant and compatible data needs to be presented.

## **8. National priorities and community participation**

To the extent it is possible to see from existing documentation the activity is consistent with existing national environmental strategies. The countries proposed for participation are the relevant ones. The social, cultural and community livelihood concerns need to be taken into account in establishing the SAP. The population concerned will according to the description be involved to a large extent.

## **9. Institutional arrangements**

The institutional arrangements to be used to undertake the project would initially be the ones used for the UNDP project, which would ensure a continuity and efficiency. The institutional arrangements will evolve with the project.

## **10. Time frame**

The time frame for the project seems to be too short, in particularly as a stepwise approach including capacity building is presented. To be able to achieve the objectives in such a short time assume that capacity building for the project is already a part of the ongoing UNDP project.

## **11. Funding**

The proposed GEF funding level seems to be appropriate but might need to give flexibility for some reallocation among the different items. The proposed co-financing contributions would be realistic.

## **12. Innovative features/replicability**

As the project is aiming at establishing a SAP in order to *prevent* environmental stress in areas at a beginning of an industrial and economic expansion the project will have unique opportunities and would thus likely be useful as a demonstration project. This is a further reason that an integrated approach of the SAP is absolutely necessary.

## **13. Sustainability**

If the awareness-raising and capacity building objectives of the project are fully achieved the project would certainly provide for sustainability after completion as it should then be able to demonstrate the need for the approach taken for the SAP and for its implementation.

## **14. Development dimensions and rationale for GEF Support**

A SAP in a region at a beginning of an industrial and economic expansion, with unique terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems and a threatened transboundary river/coastal zone system has important development dimensions as well as an important rationale for GEF involvement. For the GEF to be able to prevent threats to exclusive biodiversity and international waters, along the lines described in the document, with some modifications, merits for funding, undertaking and implementation of the project.

*11 November, 1997*

*Gunilla Björklund*

**Preparation of a Strategic Action Programme (SAP) for the Tumen River Coastal Area and related Northeast Asian Environs.** Proposed UNDP/GEF Biodiversity/International Waters project

*STAP-Roster Independent Technical Review undertaken by*

*Dr Gunilla Björklund  
Marmorvägen 16A  
S-752 44 Uppsala, SWEDEN*

---

## 1. Overall impressions

The overall impressions of the project are very positive. The area is in the early stages of a large-scale development that will pose severe threats on the environment, its unique biodiversity, including several endangered species, both in terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems and its transboundary river basin area and the nearby coastal and marine areas. As is stated in the documentation this gives a unique possibility as the SAP therefore can be design to prevent rather than cure the area, which would in the long-run mean a less costly procedure.

As the project also to a large extent will take advantage of an existing institutional structure the provisions for a less costly and more efficient structure are good. This will also imply a good basis for co-operation between participating governments and other stake-holders.

A SAP for the area should give the means for future interventions to be undertaken within a more integrated framework, which is necessary in obtaining global benefits.

## 2. Relevance and priority

The project would be of great importance as it relates to the  
a/i/ *International Waters Operational Strategy* as the SAP clearly would increase the possibilities to prevent the area from degradation of the quality of the transboundary water resources; as well as prevent from physical habitat degradation of coastal and near-shore marine areas and watercourses;

a/ii/ *Biologic Diversity Operational Strategy* as the SAP would increase awareness of the ecosystems including the unique species and the possibilities to protect them. With a carefully developed SAP, any project undertaken within its framework would also contribute to the sustainable use of biodiversity. The project description emphasizes biodiversity conservation but according to the GEF Operational Strategy and the CBD, sustainable use is as important. It is important that the SAP also includes options for the sustainable use of the biodiversity, not least to convince local people that this would imply protecting ecosystems including their endangered species, while serving human interests.

b/ The main relevant international environmental convention is the *Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)*, and as the GEF operational strategy in biological diversity incorporates the policy guidance of the COP to the CBD (a/ii/) is relevant also under this item.

Another international environmental convention of relevance for this project is the *Ramsar Convention on Wetlands*, that has initiated collaboration with the CBD in the implementation of

CBD activities related to wetlands. As wetlands are important parts of the downstream area of the Tumen catchment area it is important to relate to that convention in undertaking the project.

c/ *National/regional priorities* are likely to be appropriately regarded in the TDA and SAP processes as the national governments as well as local representation will be actively participating. It is important that national as well as local representatives are also actively participating both in designing and implementing the SAP.

### 3. Project approach

The approach of the project is in general appropriate, taking advantage of the ongoing UNDP project and to a large extent emphasising capacity building among the people involved by conducting several workshops. It is important that the procedure strives at involving national and local representatives in every step, as they are the ones, who will implement the strategy.

The approach to collect relevant information on sectors of society, on economic sectors and on different aspects of the environment, different aspects of water management (water availability and use for different sectors, water demand and demand forecast of unsustainable use, water quantity and water quality) and on different ecosystem is valuable. It is however important to clearly define the purposes of the data collection. A distinct plan ("road map") for the data needed and the purpose should be drawn. This plan would be the framework for the SAP. The project brief is somewhat unclear on the criteria to be used to specify the data needed, both when describing the "Area-based" studies and the "sector" studies. This needs to be specified both in the project document and in the SAP.

Nowhere in the project brief is any cross-sectoral analysis described as part of the SAP. The SAP need to include a discussion, analysis and conclusion on the inter-linkages between water-related environmental issues and the root causes behind different concerns. This might be included in the "causal chain analysis" but needs to be emphasized as key part of the approach of the SAP. If an integrated approach to the concerns caused by different sectors is not applied a full analysis of the causal chain is not possible and the Strategic Action Programme might lose part of the long-term strategic approach.

### 4. Objectives

a/ The objectives, to reinforce capacity to prepare a SAP, to prepare a TDA and a SAP, to design and implement an awareness raising programme, and to strengthen national and regional capacities to jointly implement the SAP, are very relevant, particularly as they are addressing the national capacities.

b and c/ The objectives are focused and would be able to achieve given the outlined activities even though the time indicated looks too short, particularly as it is somewhat unclear to what extent relevant and compatible data can be obtained.

d/ See partly above. I also have difficulties in seeing the relevance of study tours to the projects in the Danube River Basin etc. even though TDA:s and SAP:s are prepared for those project areas. A thoroughly prepared training programme is of more relevance.

## 5. Background and justification

The background and justification for the project is part of the ongoing UNDP Tumen River Area Development Programme and otherwise well provided in the documentation. Nothing of great importance for the justification has been omitted and it is most certainly more detailed in the actual project proposal. The presentation of the current situation, threats, global environmental benefits, incremental costs, degree of threat, likelihood of success, cost-effectiveness, existing institutional capacity and needs are all clearly and compellingly presented. To this is also added terms for Monitoring and Evaluation, which is a necessary part of a project. The presentation is partly short, due to the nature of the document, but anyhow compelling.

## 6. Critical analysis of the situation

The situation has been analyzed, although some of the details are most probably contained in the existing results of the ongoing UNDP programme and therefor just briefly stated in this document. This include the analysis of the system effects and externalities. Root causes and symptoms are addresses but not in any detail.

## 7. Activities

As commented above I do question the relevance for the study tours to European project sites. Otherwise the activities seems relevant to achieve the objectives, which are in a logic sequence.

I am, however, missing an important activity. When preparing a TDA and an SAP it is important not just to hold workshops with local participation on transboundary and sector studies with reference to environment and to the impact of different sectors (as specified) on the environment and natural resources. It is as important to address the cross-sectoral approach, both at local and national/regional level. The people concerned need to be aware of the causal chain behind different concerns to act accordingly. This needs to be emphasized in the document.

Also, of course a more detailed analysis on how to obtain relevant and compatible data needs to be presented.

## 8. National priorities and community participation

To the extent it is possible to see from existing documentation the activity is consistent with existing national environmental strategies. The countries proposed for participation are the relevant ones. The social, cultural and community livelihood concerns need to be taken into account in establishing the SAP. The population concerned will according to the description be involved to a large extent.

## 9. Institutional arrangements

The institutional arrangements to be used to undertake the project would initially be the ones used for the UNDP project, which would ensure a continuity and efficiency. The institutional arrangements will evolve with the project.

#### **10. Time frame**

The time frame for the project seems to be too short, in particularly as a stepwise approach including capacity building is presented. To be able to achieve the objectives in such a short time assume that capacity building for the project is already a part of the ongoing UNDP project.

#### **11. Funding**

The proposed GEF funding level seems to be appropriate but might need to give flexibility for some reallocation among the different items. The proposed co-financing contributions would be realistic.

#### **12. Innovative features/replicability**

As the project is aiming at establishing a SAP in order to *prevent* environmental stress in areas at a beginning of an industrial and economic expansion the project will have unique opportunities and would thus likely be useful as a demonstration project. This is a further reason that an integrated approach of the SAP is absolutely necessary.

#### **13. Sustainability**

If the awareness-raising and capacity building objectives of the project are fully achieved the project would certainly provide for sustainability after completion as it should then be able to demonstrate the need for the approach taken for the SAP and for its implementation.

#### **14. Development dimensions and rationale for GEF Support**

A SAP in a region at a beginning of an industrial and economic expansion, with unique terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems and a threatened transboundary river/coastal zone system has important development dimensions as well as an important rationale for GEF involvement. For the GEF to be able to prevent threats to exclusive biodiversity and international waters, along the lines described in the document, with some modifications, merits for funding, undertaking and implementation of the project.

*11 November, 1997*

*Gunilla Björklund*